

# Scoping Review of Dubious Journey of Fluorosis in India: The Situation Analysis in Telangana and the Encounter so Far

Neeraj Agarwal, Meely Panda, Vikas Bhatia<sup>1</sup>

Department of Community Medicine and Family Medicine, All India Institute of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad Metropolitan Region, Hyderabad, Telangana, India,  
<sup>1</sup>Community Medicine, All India Institute of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad, Telangana, India

## Abstract

This study aimed to do a situation analysis of Telangana and systematically map the research done in the area of fluorosis and its health risks. Identify existing gaps in the available literature and unsheath the challenges and threats in the progress so far among the people living in fluorine-contaminated zones in India. After weighing our research question, we adopted an iterative process for our search strategy by including electronic databases. A quality check was performed and guided as per the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic reviews and Meta-Analyses–scoping review (SCR) for SCRs which included details of the study type, setting, bias, funding, etc. It was found that out of the 15 studies summed up, most of them (>95%) had been conducted in South India. Nearly 27% of the studies were trials or experimental studies, 20% were studies involving groundwater sample testing, and few were *in vitro* studies. Nearly 26% were conducted on animals to see for interventions. With a total of 12,382 habitat affections, we found that Rajasthan had the highest fluoride habitation. There was a need to focus more on the seemingly less important. Many programs in India focus on risk assessment and healthy behavior. Although population affection as depicted by the Indian data statistics from the department of drinking water and sanitation show values as low as 0.01% affection for a few endemic states, they scale up to include and paralyze the lives of a lot many people in the 1.3 billion nations. At a cost, where these lives can be saved from living in suffering, what we need is mere pro-activeness, being responsible, integrating methods to tackle, using local methods to prevent, adequate nutrition, and rehabilitation.

**Keywords:** Contamination, fluorosis, rehabilitation, risk assessment, water and sanitation

## INTRODUCTION

Groundwater fluoride contamination has been a global issue for a long. The quality of water underground is rapidly undergoing immense alterations due to enhanced anthropogenic activity, which is the right away affecting the health of people who use it for drinking. Fluorite (CaF<sub>2</sub>) is the principal mineral occurring in nature and since fluorine element is highly reactive, it causes deadly epidemics affecting millions.<sup>[1,2]</sup> In India, where 68% of people are rural-based, a large proportion migrates each year to cities in hopes of a better future, education, and living. This gives rise to a battle of accession for water, space, sanitation, ventilation, food, and other cardinal requisites. When fundamental privileges are at stake, the other pillars for education, housing, earning, etc., start dwindling and become a part of the vicious trap. This shift from an apparent place of abundance to a society of struggles for basic living standards creates a K-shaped discrepancy between the affluent and indigents.

With 200 million affected across 28 nations, it is a global health pandemic lurking to pounce.<sup>[2,3]</sup> This proclamation that more than 200 million people across the globe are at risk of fluorosis, raises a global alarm and concern which needs immediate address.<sup>[4]</sup> Those industries dealing with fertilizers, drugs, aluminum, ore, metal electroplating, steel, and nuclear activities use excessive amounts of fluoride-containing compounds.<sup>[5]</sup> The fluorine toxicity builds up in the human body through foodstuffs, drugs, water, cosmetics, etc. However,

**Address for correspondence:** Dr. Meely Panda,

Department of Community Medicine and Family Medicine, All India Institute of Medical Sciences, Bibinagar, Hyderabad Metropolitan Region, Hyderabad, Telangana, India.  
 E-mail: meeliepanda@gmail.com

This is an open access journal, and articles are distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0 License, which allows others to remix, tweak, and build upon the work non-commercially, as long as appropriate credit is given and the new creations are licensed under the identical terms.

**For reprints contact:** WKHLRPMedknow\_reprints@wolterskluwer.com

**How to cite this article:** Agarwal N, Panda M, Bhatia V. Scoping review of dubious journey of fluorosis in india: The situation analysis in Telangana and the encounter so far. *Int J Env Health Eng* 2023;12:27.

**Received:** 18-04-2022, **Revised:** 05-09-2022,  
**Accepted:** 14-09-2022, **Published:** 21-11-2023

### Access this article online

Quick Response Code:



Website:  
[www.ijehe.org](http://www.ijehe.org)

DOI:  
 10.4103/ijehe.ijehe\_16\_22

among these, drinking water is the single main route of daily intake.<sup>[6]</sup> Low amounts of fluoride are necessary for humans and other animals for tooth and bone development. It is particularly necessary for infants and young children below 8 years old when present within acceptable ranges.<sup>[7]</sup> Long-term intake of high levels of fluoride in drinking water (above 8 mg/L daily) can result in skeletal and dental fluorosis. These problems are more severe, especially in warm and dry climates where drinking water contains excessive amounts of fluoride.<sup>[8]</sup> In recent years, this has become more problematic, since people migrate to cities in hope of better and end up staying in deficit with the already exhausted source. Human health risk assessment forms an important tool to potentially estimate the harmful effects on human health.<sup>[9-11]</sup>

The first report in 1937 in the state of Andhra Pradesh mentioned the plight and Telangana state, now, is considered to be endemic to the problem.<sup>[12]</sup> Statistics quoted figures as high as 40 million sufferers due to dental fluorosis.<sup>[13]</sup> Excessive presence was noticed in nearly 177 districts out of 20 states, thereby affecting 65 million people and 6 million children then.<sup>[14]</sup> Several studies have been done in recent times which highlight the health risk assessment of groundwater pollution on humanity.<sup>[15-17]</sup> Narsimha and Sudarshan 2016 carried out a hydrogeochemical investigation in Siddipet, Telangana to understand the distribution of fluoride in groundwater zones. It showed that nearly 22% have more than the permissible limit responsible for the major chunk of endemic fluorosis in that area.<sup>[18]</sup> In Nalgonda district which was previously part of Andhra Pradesh, now Telangana, children present with limb deformities because of which they drop out of school, lead a hopeless life with embarrassment and struggle to be able to cope with their peers. Parents are forced to take care of their physically handicapped kids who were born normal, which if intervened at the right time and the right way would have prevented the circumstances.<sup>[19,20]</sup>

Even though studies are many, they are mostly disjunctive; some being conducted by geologists and others being done by clinicians and public health experts. The present review will provide us with a wholesome depiction of the challenges and opportunities during the encounter, systematically map the research done in the area of fluorosis and health risks, identify existing gaps in the available literature and unsheathe the challenges and threats in the progress so far among the people living in fluorine-contaminated zones in our country; more specifically in Telangana.

## MATERIALS AND METHODS

### Data search and collection

After weighing our research question, we adopted an iterative process for our search strategy by including electronic databases, a list of references, working papers, and patents. The MEDLINE, PUBMED database in NLM was advanced surfed with medical sub-headings like (Fluorosis and India), (De fluoridation and Telangana) and fluoride peril. Articles

were chosen as depicted in Table 1 Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic reviews and Meta-Analyses scoping review framework.

### Quality check

The search strategies were repeat-checked by two other reviewers using the peer review checklist and finalized over time by discussion. Data Extraction: A single final form was then created which was continuously updated and included details of the study type, setting, bias, funding, etc.

### Situation analysis

We provided a snapshot of the present scenario of fluorosis by detailing the prevalence as obtained from reports available from the internet Google search engine, by a secondary strategic analysis.

## RESULT

### Perils of fluorosis

Most of the studies related to the problems of fluorosis have been conducted in South India; as depicted in Table 2. Very few studies could be retrieved from other parts such as Rajasthan, Odisha, or Delhi. Nearly 27% of the studies were trials or experimental studies, 20% were studies involving groundwater sample testing, and few were *in vitro* studies. All were from indexed journal articles and published beyond 2005. Nearly 26% were conducted on animals to see for interventions. A retrospective study analyzed data from the previous 2 years (Asawa *et al.*)<sup>[28]</sup> and case-control highlighted the genetic effect (Rahila *et al.*)<sup>[21]</sup> Sample size varied from a minimum of 12 rats (Basha and Sujitha)<sup>[31]</sup> under study to 653 fishermen studied (John *et al.*)<sup>[27]</sup> The effects of tamarind leaf (Samal *et al.*), Moringa powder (Mandal *et al.*), tetracycline Strontium, citric acid, sodium fluoride (SAF) (Sadanand and Vandana), and Vitamin E/D (Kumar *et al.*) having enhancing

**Table 1: Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses eligibility framework**

Eligibility criteria	Reason for exclusion
Records identified through database searching ( $n=149$ )	Exclusion of records - duplication ( $n=75$ )
Additional records identified from other sources ( $n=16$ )	Exclusion after screening ( $n=41$ )
Records after removing duplication ( $n=75$ )	Due to incompleteness, animal studies with dissimilar variables, non-Indian studies, abstract, working paper, beyond time frame, language
Records screened ( $n=90$ )	Full text articles excluded ( $n=34$ )
Records excluded ( $n=41$ )	Different sets of objective and outcome ( $n=12$ )
Full text articles assessed for eligibility ( $n=49$ )	Dissimilar variables used for assessment ( $n=5$ )
Full text articles excluded with reasons ( $n=34$ )	Dental studies with different outcome ( $n=4$ )
Studies included in quantitative synthesis ( $n=15$ )	Chemical studies demonstrating mere knowledge about the composition ( $n=8$ )
	Geologic studies with less on health risk ( $n=3$ )
	Animal studies of no relevance ( $n=1$ )
	Combined study of both nitrate and fluoride ( $n=1$ )

**Table 2: Study characteristics and domain on fluorosis in India from 2005 to 2020**<sup>[17,22,26-39]</sup>

Author (1 <sup>st</sup> )	Country	Design	Setting	Time	Publish	Outcome	Sample
Rahila	India	Case control	Patients with dental fluorosis	2019	<i>Saudi Dental Journal</i>	Gene polymorphism has significant association with dental fluorosis	22
Samal	India	Clinical trial	Animals with fluoride toxicity	2016	<i>Veterinary World</i>	Tamarindus leaf powder corrected the effect of FL toxicity	40
Arya et al.	South India	Water sample test	Ground water samples and health risk assessment	2019	<i>Environmental Geochemistry and Health</i>	Spatio-temporal variation shows FL conc to be high in monsoons due to the calcite dilution and ion exchange. HQ maximum for kids	118 wells
Levin	Karnataka, India	Water test using smart phone	Endemic areas in Karnataka	2016	<i>Science of the Total Environment</i>	The smartphone technic was economic and suitable for ground water analysis	200 sample
Sadanand	India	<i>In vitro</i> study	Fluorosed dentin specimen	2016	<i>The Open Dentistry Journal</i>	Root biomodification (SAF) using tetracycline, citric acid alters fluorosed dentin	-
Mandal et al.	Odisha, India	Screening experimental trial	Among fluorosed cattle in, Odisha	2015	<i>Veterinary World</i>	Ameliorative potential of dried <i>Moringa oleifera</i> fruit powder in fluorosis affected calves	107
John et al.	Kutch, Gujrat	Descriptive cross sectional	Skeletal fluorosis among fishermen using diagnostic tests	2015	<i>Roczniki Panstwowego Zakladu Higieny</i>	Skeletal fluorosis - 30.3%, associated with age, gender, tobacco, alcohol consumption habit's duration	653 fishermen
Asawa et al.	Pacific hospital	Retrospective analysis	Disease pattern and services in outreach programs	2015	<i>Roczniki Panstwowego Zakladu Higieny</i>	33% dental fluorosis. increase community-awareness programs	2-year data
Singh et al.	Udaipur	School based survey	Urinary fluoride status and comparison of free T4, free T3	2014	<i>Springer Plus</i>	Significant relationship of water fluoride to urine and serum fluoride and relationship with (FT3/FT4) and TSH	60
Naresh kumar et al.	-	Intervention with Vitamin D/E supplements	Effect of FL on reproductive system and role of Vitamin D/E	2012	<i>Toxicol International</i>	Vitamin E - significant sperm count improvement. Vitamin D - both motility and sperm count improved	60
Basha et al.	Bangalore	Experimental study	Effects of high FL on heart of rats	2011	<i>Toxicology International</i>	Excess intake - decreases growth rate while selenium has no effect on body weight. Vitamin E - most significant antioxidant	12
Reddy et al.	Hyderabad	Review article	Skeletal fluorosis, neurological sequel in renal impairment	2009	<i>Neurology India</i>	Anti-curare effects, mostly mechanical neurologic manifests with high complications and no use of surgery	22 articles
Adimalla et al.	Telangana	Testing water quality samples	Water samples in borewells collected and health risk assessment done	2018	<i>Human and Ecological Assessment</i>	20% of ground water with high fluoride mostly by ingestion. kids face higher health risk and hazard	34 samples
Ayoob et al.	Kharagpur	Critical review	Stress effects of fluorine	2007	<i>Environmental Science and Technology</i>	Prey increasing and stress effects more on kids. Relation between poverty, heat, labor etc.	
Karunanidhi et al.	South India	Estimation of health risk scores	Health risk assessment	2019	<i>Human and Ecological Risk Assessment: International Journal</i>	Necessary to estimate THI and HQ levels to screen out. 87% risk in children	60

SAF: Strontium, citric acid, sodium fluoride, HQ: Hazard quotient, THI: Total hazard index, FL: Chronic fluoride, TSH: Thyroid-stimulating hormone

properties were shown as the outcome.<sup>[22,25,26,30]</sup> Most of the water samples tested showed high levels of fluoride varying from 20% to 35%. The health effects in form of a Hazard quotient were the maximum found in children (as high as 87% risk) as significantly documented in most of the studies (26%).<sup>[23,33]</sup> Other factors contributing to the increased stress were poverty, age, heat stress, occupation, and nutrition. The stress effects

of fluorine toxicity were formulated using the hazard scores and total hazard index (THI) score which gave indirect proof of the health profile of the population. It shows the ratio of the pollutant to the desired reference level. The most common mode of affection was ingestion as demonstrated by all followed by the routes of inhalation. Industrial workers and newborns were highly susceptible to the effects of poisoning (Ayoob and Gupta 2006).<sup>[17]</sup>

Skeletal and neurological manifests were the severe spectrum with little or no hope of surgery (Reddy and John *et al.*).<sup>[27,32]</sup>

## DISCUSSION

### GEOGRAPHIC DISTRIBUTION AND ENDEMICITY

Table 3 depicts the trend of fluoride endemicity and its prevalence as available from the government of India state-wise data for 2019 as obtained from the department of drinking water and sanitation. Rajasthan has the highest fluoride habitation because of the large size of the state, and the percentage of rural dry arid areas which have depleted groundwater levels leading to contamination over time. However, the fluoride population affected is also quite high i.e., 4,194,310 which is the highest contributor for India i.e., 6%. Of particular concern is the state of Bihar which shows fewer habitations to be affected but the population affected is too high in comparison (>1%). This provides us food for thought over causes that lead to fluoride toxicity; one of them being the thyroid–goiter belt. The state of Telangana which was previously part of Andhra Pradesh shows a 3.4% prevalence which is just better than the highest affected state of Rajasthan.

### PROMINENT SCHEMES

Year-wise lists of predominant schemes rolled out for fluoride decontamination from time to time have been put up in Table 4. The first one started in 1987 by the Rajiv Gandhi National Drinking Water Mission started by the Ministry of Rural Development which had limited coverage<sup>[36]</sup> The SACHETNA PLUS by the Karnataka government in 1996 covered up the defluoridation techniques by the rainwater harvesting techniques.<sup>[37]</sup>

With the help of the Banawasi Seva Ashram, the Peoples Science Institute began a program of fluoride testing and

fluorosis mitigation in the Sonebhadra district in UP in September 2004.<sup>[38]</sup> A health-based risk assessment of fluorosis was carried out in the blocks of Gorakhpur Uttar Pradesh, Pradesh, India. The Integrated Fluorosis Mitigation approach imparted a better understanding of the adverse effects of fluoride consumption and allowed them to take proper actions.<sup>[39]</sup>

The National Programme for Prevention and Control of Fluorosis was launched in 2008 initially as a pilot in 100 districts by the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, India. The following strategies were considered. Surveillance in the community; Capacity building, diagnostic facilities; management including treatment surgery, and rehabilitation.<sup>[40]</sup>

The Jal Jeevan Mission was envisioned to provide safe and adequate drinking water through individual household tap connections by 2024 to all households in rural India. The program implemented source sustainability measures as mandatory elements, such as recharge and reuse through grey water management, water conservation, rainwater harvesting, etc.<sup>[41]</sup>

The Mission Bhagiratha Project owing its success to the Siddipet project which focused on one tap to each household is a continuation of the same with added strategies. With a total of 26 segments and a project outlay of Rs 45,028 crores and 1.11 sq km covered, it is one such large project which has benefitted 2.72 crores of population and 24,225 rural habitations in Telangana.<sup>[42]</sup>

### REVIEW ANALYSIS

There is a need to focus more on the seemingly less important. Although, population affection as depicted by the Indian Data statistics from the department of drinking water and sanitation show values as low as 0.01% affection for a few

**Table 3: Trend analysis of fluoride affected areas (2019)<sup>[35]</sup>**

States	Fluoride habitation	Fluoride population	Total population of the state	Percentage population affected
Assam	285	113,837	31,966,238	0.4
Bihar	898	1,100,274	103,804,637	1.05
Chhattisgarh	405	131,263	25,540,196	0.5
Haryana	119	296,751	25,353,081	1.1
Jammu and Kashmir	4	9586	12,548,926	0.07
Jharkhand	552	263,870	32,966,238	0.8
Karnataka	600	402,674	61,130,704	0.6
Kerala	34	80,427	33,387,677	0.24
Madhya Pradesh	171	73,219	72,597,565	0.1
Maharashtra	79	154,985	112,372,972	0.13
Odisha	105	29,993	41,947,358	0.07
Punjab	302	362,035	27,704,236	1.31
Rajasthan	6087	4,194,310	68,621,012	6.1
Telangana	877	1,204,472	35,286,757	3.4
Uttar Pradesh	179	310,011	199,812,341	0.2
West Bengal	1336	838,552	91,347,736	1

<https://data.gov.in/resources/state-wise-number-arsenic-and-fluoride-affected-habitations-population-reported-integrated>. <https://fluoridealert.org/news/state-wise-number-of-arsenic-and-fluoride-affected-habitations-with-population/2019>

**Table 4: Detail of the various noteworthy schemes and policies for the control of fluorosis in India**

Year	Scheme	Governed by	Progress and process
1987–1993	Rajiv Gandhi National Drinking Water Mission started by Ministry of Rural Development <a href="https://phed.cg.gov.in/sites/default/files/ruraldrinkingwater-2nd-april-0-0-0.pdf">https://phed.cg.gov.in/sites/default/files/ruraldrinkingwater-2nd-april-0-0-0.pdf</a>	Coordinated by fluorosis control cell at the All-India Institute of Medical Sciences, Delhi had a limited coverage	Worked for control of fluorosis through its awareness campaign
2000	Project SARITA <a href="https://www.cdac.in/index.aspx?id=print_page&amp;print=egov1">https://www.cdac.in/index.aspx?id=print_page&amp;print=egov1</a>	UNICEF sponsorship in Rajasthan	Fluorosis mitigation programme by the defluoridation technique using drum sets and alumina filters
1996	SACHETANA PLUS <a href="https://www.indiawaterportal.org/articles/mid-term-assessment-sachetana-drinking-water-plus-project-fluorosis-mitigation-bird-k">https://www.indiawaterportal.org/articles/mid-term-assessment-sachetana-drinking-water-plus-project-fluorosis-mitigation-bird-k</a>	BIRD-K	Defluoridation using rain water harvesting technique
2004	FMP <a href="https://peoplescienceinstitute.org/resrch.html">https://peoplescienceinstitute.org/resrch.html</a>	People science institute in collaboration with Banwasi Sewa Ashram	Fluoride testing and fluoride mitigation and nutritional intervention in UP
2005	FMP, Odisha <a href="http://www.svaindia.org/environment-and-ecology/">http://www.svaindia.org/environment-and-ecology/</a>	PSI along with Sahbhagi Vikash Abhiyan	Safe sanitary wells, domestic kits for defluoridation
2008	FMP <a href="http://www.vasudhavikassansthan.org/focused_area.htm">http://www.vasudhavikassansthan.org/focused_area.htm</a>	Water Aid (UK) PSI, Vasudha Vikas Sansthan	Done in MP with provision of safe water for drinking. Could reverse skeletal fluorosis
2004	Government of AP <a href="http://www.saioralhealthfoundation.org/saioralhealth/">http://www.saioralhealthfoundation.org/saioralhealth/</a>	In collaboration with Sai Oral Health Foundation	Provision of low fluoride water in affected villages through use of domestic defluoridators using bone char and rain water harvesting
2007	Integrated Fluorosis Mitigation <a href="https://www.ircwash.org/resources/integrated-fluorosis-mitigation-guidance-manual">https://www.ircwash.org/resources/integrated-fluorosis-mitigation-guidance-manual</a>	NEERI in association with UNICEF and ICMR	Water dilution, nutrition supplements in schools, IEC, quality chemical assessments, water dilutions etc.
2009	NRDWP <a href="https://ejalshakti.gov.in/IMISReports/NRDWP_MIS_NationalRuralDrinkingWaterProgramme.html">https://ejalshakti.gov.in/IMISReports/NRDWP_MIS_NationalRuralDrinkingWaterProgramme.html</a>	By Government of India	Sustain provision of adequate safe water for drinking and household activities
2008–2009	National Programme for Prevention and Control of Fluorosis <a href="https://main.mohfw.gov.in/major-programmes/other-national-health-programmes/national-programme-prevention-and-control-fluorosis-nppcf">https://main.mohfw.gov.in/major-programmes/other-national-health-programmes/national-programme-prevention-and-control-fluorosis-nppcf</a>	Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Government of India. NPPCF	100 districts of 17 states were covered during 11 <sup>th</sup> plan, further 11 districts were taken up during 2013–2015 (over 19 states) and additional 84 new districts are to be taken up during the remaining period of 12 <sup>th</sup> plan
2010	Dependent Schemes <a href="https://www.hic-net.org/depleting-groundwater-levels-and-increasing-fluoride-concentration-in-villages-of-mehsana-district-gujarat-india-cost-to-economy-and-health/">https://www.hic-net.org/depleting-groundwater-levels-and-increasing-fluoride-concentration-in-villages-of-mehsana-district-gujarat-india-cost-to-economy-and-health/</a>	Dharoi, Sabarmati and Narmada canal dependent schemes	Import of surface of water. By Government of Gujrat
2016	Mission Bhagirathi <a href="https://missionbhagiratha.telangana.gov.in/">https://missionbhagiratha.telangana.gov.in/</a>	By Government of Telangana	Community water treatment and safe water supply

FM: Fluoride mitigation, FMP: Fluoride mitigation project, FMP: Fluoride mitigation program, PSI: People Science Institute, NEERI: National Environmental Engineering Research Institute, NRDWP: National Rural Drinking Water Program, BIRD-K: BAIF Institute for Rural Development, Karnataka, AP: Andhra Pradesh, MP: Member of Parliament, IEC: Information, Education and Communication, NPPCF: National Programme for Prevention and Control of Fluorosis

endemic states, it scales up to include and paralyzes the lives of a lot many people in the 1.3 billion nation.<sup>[34,35]</sup> Urban area monitoring for any pipe damage or leakage becomes equally important. Many studies done in this regard show that defluoridation techniques, Moringa, Tamarind, Vitamin C, D, E, Selenium, and Tetracycline citric acid SAF have ameliorative potential.<sup>[22-24,26,31]</sup> Further human trials can establish evidence to halt and reverse the peril. Reddy in their review article discussed that defluoridation methods tend to increase aluminum levels of filtered water which is being incriminated in the causation of neurodegenerative diseases and hence these methods are not preferred by WHO.<sup>[32]</sup>

Adimalla and Venkatayogi 2018, narrated how the groundwater is facing severe quality problems. The total dissolved solid, bicarbonate, Calcium, Magnesium, etc., were within acceptable

limits as per standards in a large number of groundwater samples which however was not true for fluoride (21%) and Nitrate (26%). Based on the total health risk assessment, 67.65%, 79.41%, and 82.35% of the samples had high noncarcinogenic risk, exceeding the maximum allowable limit as per USEPA.<sup>[15]</sup> Karunanidhi *et al.* mentioned that recently born babies were more helpless to the dual poisonous effects of Nitrate and fluorine; because of the intake of polluted drinking water. This might lead to a physical mechanical problem in form of staining or deformities, but beyond that, it can also create a chronic state of oxygen deficiency.<sup>[33]</sup> There are many highly efficient governmental efforts being carried out targeting the source, the process, the effect, and the outcome.<sup>[39-41]</sup> However, the results somewhat seem disproportionate. It becomes important here to work in teams and not as discrete

experts. A geological investigation with apt detailing of the rocks and surface won't do any good if it doesn't process the risk it throws to the human and his health.

## THE STUMBLING BLOCKS

Telangana with a population of 35,286,757 has an area of 114,840 km<sup>2</sup> with 307/km<sup>2</sup> of population density as per the census state-wise details. The hard rock terrain, deformation features, and joint fractures facilitate the movement of groundwater in the region in different weather conditions.<sup>[1,44]</sup>

Narsimha and Rajitha 2018 showed that the groundwater samples from the selected districts in Telangana showed higher predilections postmonsoon which drastically reduced in the premonsoon times.<sup>[44]</sup> Low fluoride concentrations were observed in the northern part of the study region in pre- and post-monsoon seasons and spatial distribution of elevated fluoride concentration was seen in the southern region. Reddy and Rao said that such a distribution pattern was mainly due to the weathering mineral dissolution and the divergent fracture system associated with the hydrochemical process.<sup>[45]</sup> Relative sparse and abundant distribution of the fluoride-bearing mineral might account for these dissimilarities.

The chronic daily intake, hazard quotient, daily ingestion dose, reference dose, total exposure, and average body weight, are all equally important to determine the ultimate suffering. Many studies have either shown the topographic details or the health risk assessment in disjunction.<sup>[46,47]</sup> Doing so gives us focal and patchy ideas of the same problem repeatedly and we still land in the tunnel of the problem. For problems whose source is to stay with us, a compensated approach involving sufferers, service providers, and service regulators would benefit the best.

## TELANGANA: THEN AND NOW

Before being a separate state, Siddipet had implemented the pilot project on one tap in each household in 1998. Over the years, the weather conditions, terrain, and landscapes underwent heavy alterations owing to nature. In 2013, the DFMC-District Fluoride Monitoring Centre came up with the Convergence of interdepartmental mitigation strategies for Fluoride monitoring to act from a single platform. UNICEF provided financial and technical support for the same. There was a pledge for the supply of safe and fluoride-free drinking water (Krishna water).<sup>[47]</sup> Then came the mission Bhagiratha<sup>[42]</sup> under the present minister of the state with a vision to ensure safe and sustainable piped drinking water supply from surface water sources.

The strategies are staged from the source to the supply with water treatment plant, pump treated water and sumps at the highest points, transmission from the highest point through a second pipeline network to all the habitations by gravity (98%), distribution to each household through a modern, rationalized intra village network thereby providing tap connections to each household. It has thus been declared a flagship program by the

Telangana Drinking Water Supply Corporation Limited This Telangana model is also being emulated in Bihar, Karnataka, and Maharashtra states.<sup>[42]</sup>

## THE COURSE OF ACTION TO MITIGATION

Defluoridation has been the most conventional method used. However, its costly and so water for cooking and drinking purposes are only being treated. The common techniques used are Activated Alumina prepared by low-temperature dehydration of Aluminum hydroxides.<sup>[48,49]</sup> Calcined Clay which adsorbs excess amount of fluoride present in the raw drinking water,<sup>[48,49,50]</sup> mud pots for the collection and storage, natural adsorbent using plant-based defluoridation technique, Ion exchange, precipitation, contact precipitation, and the Nalgonda technique as the first community-based plant for removal as developed by National Environmental Engineering Research Institute, Nagpur in 1961<sup>[48]</sup> A vegetable grown commonly in rural areas has a very high calcium content. Krishnamachari *et al.* reported that consumption of Chakoda Bhaji resulted in reversal of skeletal fluorosis. Hence consumption of Chakoda Bhaji is promoted as a part of Integrated Fluorosis Mitigation.<sup>[51]</sup> Chemical risk assessment, hazard assessment, dose-response and risk characterization, cluster-wise community diagnosis, facility mapping, reconstructive surgery, financial support, etc., are some of the other public health interventions so far.<sup>[51]</sup>

## THE WAY FORWARD

Alternative methods which are cost-effective, less time-consuming, and more efficient need to come up. Although locating an alternative source of water is the best method, it is time-consuming and difficult. Dual water sources help in keeping the cooking and drinking water safe. This saves time and money and a lot of hard work too. Rainwater harvesting is also one such option that can be used for providing a safe water supply to the residents. Industrial fluorosis can be prevented by rigorous enforcement of procedures for minimizing industrial fluoride pollution and ensuring the fluoride content of urine is below 5 ppm.

## CONCLUSION

Geologists, public health engineering, public health specialist, and clinicians together, can depict the association and causation which will then create a way out. When each specialist works for his department, they get the best out, but that in no way is relatable or contributes to resolution. It is before channelizing all the sectors to work in teams and take up metacentric projects to be able to come out of the problem tunnel. A few recommendations are:

### For people

Create awareness about the problem, Wash and cook vegetables properly before intake, habituate people regarding the best practices, Vitamin C and E, and other antioxidants, and take

calcium-rich food in the form of vegetables, green leafy products, and milk.

### For providers

Alternate and cost-effective sources of de-fluoridation, Alternate sources for providing drinking water from other rivers or areas, Screening of workers in industries, dilution, isolation, and filtration techniques for avoiding the fumes or gases, and diet-rich supplements.

### For policy-makers

Institute funding for innovation and initiatives, integrated and mixed model involving public and private enterprises, quality check and surveillance techniques.

### Acknowledgments

#### Financial support and sponsorship

Nil.

### Conflicts of interest

There are no conflicts of interest.

## REFERENCES

- Saxena V, Ahmed S. Inferring chemical parameters for the dissolution of fluoride in groundwater. *Environ Geol* 2003;43:731-6.
- Li C, Gao X, Wang Y. Hydrogeochemistry of high-fluoride groundwater at Yuncheng Basin, Northern China. *Sci Total Environ* 2015;508:155-65.
- Wu J, Sun Z. Evaluation of shallow groundwater contamination and associated human health risk in an alluvial plain impacted by agricultural and industrial activities, mid-west China. *Expo Health* 2015;8:311-29.
- Taiyuan Declaration on Water Quality and Arsenic, Inter-Regional Conference on Water Quality and Arsenic Mitigation organized in Taiyuan, China, November 23–26; 2004.
- Iheozor-Ejiofor Z, Worthington HV, Walsh T, O'Malley L, Clarkson JE, Macey R, et al. Water fluoridation for the prevention of dental caries. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* 2015; p. CD010856.
- Naghizadeh A, Shahabi H, Ghasemi F, Zarei A. Synthesis of walnut shell modified with titanium dioxide and zinc oxide nanoparticles for efficient removal of humic acid from aqueous solutions. *J Water Health* 2016;14:989-97.
- Hammari LE, Laghzizil A, Barboux P, Lahlil K, Saoiabi A. Retention of fluoride ions from aqueous solution using porous hydroxyapatite. Structure and conduction properties. *J Hazard Mater* 2004;114:41-4.
- Prashanth L, Kattapagari KK, Chitturi RT. A review on role of essential trace elements in health and disease. *J Dr NTR Univ Health Sci* 2015;4:75.
- Yousefi M, Ghoochani M, Hossein Mahvi A. Health risk assessment to fluoride in drinking water of rural residents living in the Poldasht city, Northwest of Iran. *Ecotoxicol Environ Saf* 2018;148:426-30.
- Yousefi N, Fatehizadeh A, Ghadiri K. Application of nanofilter in removal of phosphate, fluoride and nitrite from groundwater. *Desalination Water Treat* 2016;57:11782-8.
- Ghaderpoori M, Paydar M, Zarei A, Alidadi H, Najafpoor AA, Gohary AH, et al. Health risk assessment of fluoride in water distribution network of Mashhad, Iran. *Hum Ecol Risk Assess Int J* 2018;25:1-12. [DOI: 10.1080/10807039.2018.1453297].
- Short HE, McRobert TW, Bernard AS, Mannadinayer AS. Endemic fluorosis in Madras presidency. *Indian J Med Res* 1937;25:553-61.
- Karthikeyan G, Anitha CE, Vishwanathan G. Effect of certain macro and micro minerals on fluoride toxicity. *Indian J Environ Proct* 2005;25:601-9.
- Gupta S, Banerjee S, Saha R, Datta JK, Mondal N. Fluoride geochemistry of ground water in Nalhati-1 block of Birbhum district, West Bengal, India. *Fluoride* 2006;39:318-20.
- Adimalla N, Venkatayogi S. Geochemical characterization and evaluation of groundwater suitability for domestic and agricultural utility in semi-arid region of Basara, Telangana State, South India. *Appl Water Sci* 2018;8:44.
- Ahada CP, Suthar S. Assessment of Human Health Risk Associated with High Groundwater Fluoride Intake in Southern Districts of Punjab, India. *Expo Health* 2017:1-9.
- Ayoob S, Gupta AK. Fluoride in drinking water: A review on the status and stress effects. *Crit Rev Environ Sci Technol* 2006;36:433-87.
- Narsimha A, Sudarshan V. Contamination of fluoride in groundwater and its effect on human health: A case study in hard rock aquifers of Siddipet, Telangana State, India. *Appl Water Sci* 2017; 7:2501-12.
- Shivashankara AR, Shankara SY, Rao HS, Bhat PG. A clinical and biochemical study of chronic fluoride toxicity in children of Kheru Thanda of Gulbarga District, Karnataka, India. *Fluoride* 2000;33:66-73.
- WHO [World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland]. Fluoride and Arsenic in Drinking Water. Geneva, Switzerland: World Health Organization; 2004. Available from: <http://www.who.int/ceh/publications/en/08fluor.pdf>. [Last accessed on 2020 Nov 22].
- Rahila C, Aswath Narayanan MB, Ramesh Kumar SG, Leena Selvamary A, Sujatha A, John Kirubakaran J. Association of COL1A2 (PvuII) gene polymorphism with risk and severity of dental fluorosis – A case control study. *Saudi Dent J* 2019;31:463-8.
- Samal P, Patra RC, Gupta AR, Mishra SK, Jena D, Satapathy D. Effect of *Tamarindus indica* leaf powder on plasma concentrations of copper, zinc, and iron in fluorotic cows. *Vet World* 2016;9:1121-4.
- Arya S, Subramani T, Vennila G, Karunanidhi D. Health risks associated with fluoride intake from rural drinking water supply and inverse mass balance modeling to decipher hydrogeochemical processes in Vattamalaikarai river basin, South India. *Environ Geochem Health* 2021;43:705-16.
- Levin S, Krishnan S, Rajkumar S, Halery N, Balkunde P. Monitoring of fluoride in water samples using a smartphone. *Sci Total Environ* 2016;551-552:101-7.
- Sadanand K, Vandana KL. Effects of tetracycline, EDTA and citric acid application on nonfluorosed and fluorosed dentin: An *in vitro* study. *Open Dent J* 2016;10:109-16.
- Mandal KD, Das MR, Pati M, Pati PD, Gupta AR, Patra RC, et al. Effect of moringa oleifera on hematological parameters of calves reared in industrial fluorotic area. *Vet World* 2015;8:1364-9.
- John J, Hariharan M, Remy V, Haleem S, Thajuraj PK, Deepak B, et al. Prevalence of skeletal fluorosis in fisherman from Kutch coast, Gujarat, India. *Rocz Panstw Zakl Hig* 2015;66:379-82.
- Asawa K, Bhanushali NV, Tak M, Kumar DR, Rahim MF, Alshahran OA, et al. Utilization of services and referrals through dental outreach programs in rural areas of India. A two year study. *Rocz Panstw Zakl Hig* 2015;66:275-80.
- Singh N, Verma KG, Verma P, Sidhu GK, Sachdeva S. A comparative study of fluoride ingestion levels, serum thyroid hormone & TSH level derangements, dental fluorosis status among school children from endemic and non-endemic fluorosis areas. *Springerplus* 2014;3:7.
- Kumar N, Sood S, Arora B, Singh M, Beena, Roy PS. To Study the Effect of Vitamin D and E on Sodium-Fluoride-induced Toxicity in Reproductive Functions of Male Rabbits. *Toxicol Int* 2012;19:182-7. <https://doi.org/10.4103/0971-6580.97220>.
- Basha MP, Sujitha NS. Chronic fluoride toxicity and myocardial damage: Antioxidant offered protection in second generation rats. *Toxicol Int* 2011;18:99-104.
- Reddy DR. Neurology of endemic skeletal fluorosis. *Neurol India* 2009;57:7-12.
- Karunanidhi D, Aravinthasamy P, Subramani T, Wu J, Srinivasamoorthy K. Potential health risk assessment for fluoride and nitrate contamination in hard rock aquifers of Shanmuganadhi River basin, South India, *Hum Ecol Risk Assess Int J* 2019;25(1-2). [DOI: 10.1080/10807039.2019.1568859].
- Available from: <https://data.gov.in/resources/state-wise-number-arsenic-and-fluoride-affected-habitations-population-reported-integrated>. [Last accessed on 2020 Nov 22].
- Available from: <https://fluoridealert.org/news/state-wise-number-of-arsenic-and-fluoride-affected-habitations-with-population/2019>. [Last accessed on 2020 Nov 22].

36. Department of Drinking Water Supply, Ministry of Rural Development, Government of India. Rajiv Gandhi National Drinking Water Mission, National Rural Drinking Water Programme. 2010. p. 46.
37. Mythri H, Dinesh, Bennadi D. Current public health perspective of fluorosis mitigation project in Pavagada taluk, Karnataka. *Indian J Occup Environ Med* 2012;16:124-6.
38. Gautam A, Tripathi RC. Fluoride Testing and Fluorosis Mitigation In Sonebhadra District. Available from: <https://ideas.repec.org/p/ess/wpaper/id1853.html>. [Last accessed on 2020 Nov 22].
39. NEERI, UNICEF. Report on Integrated Fluorosis Mitigation. 2007. p. 86.
40. Ministry of Health and Family Welfare. Available from: <https://nhm.gov.in/index1.php?lang=1&level=3&sublinkid=1055&lid=611>. [Last assessed in 2020 Nov 22].
41. Available from: <https://jalshakti-ddws.gov.in/about-us>. [Last accessed on 2020 Nov 21].
42. Available from: <https://missionbhagiratha.telangana.gov.in>. [Last accessed on 2020 Nov 22].
43. Reddy AG, Reddy DV, Rao PN, Prasad KM. Hydrogeochemical characterization of fluoride rich groundwater of Wailpalli watershed, Nalgonda District, Andhra Pradesh, India. *Environ Monit Assess* 2010;171:561-77.
44. Narsimha A, Rajitha S. Spatial distribution and seasonal variation in fluoride enrichment in groundwater and its associated human health risk assessment in Telangana State, South India, *Hum Ecol Risk Assess Int J* 2018;24(2):1-14. [DOI: 10.1080/10807039.2018.1438176].
45. Reddy AG, Rao PN. Occurrence, behaviour and genesis of fluoride in groundwater of Wailpalli Watershed in Nalgonda District, Andhra Pradesh, India. *J Appl Geochem* 2006;8:618-30.
46. Naz A, Mishra BK, Gupta SK. Human health risk assessment of chromium in drinking water: A case study of Sukinda Chromite Mine, Odisha, India. *Expo Health* 2016;8:253-64.
47. Available from: <https://nalgonda.telangana.gov.in/fluoride-monitoring>. [Last accessed on 2020 Nov 22].
48. Iyenger L. Technologies for fluoride removal. In: Smet J, van Wijk C, editors. *Small Community Water Supplies: Technology, People and Partnerships*. Delft, Netherlands: IRC; 2003. p. 499-514.
49. Daw RK. International Conference on People-Centred Approaches to Water and Environmental Sanitation. Experiences with Domestic Defluoridation in India. *Proceedings of the 30<sup>th</sup>. Vientiane, Lao PDR: WEDC; 2004. p. 467-73.*
50. Rajchagool S. The Applied ICOH Defluoridator. In: Dahi E, Bregnhøj H, editors. *Proceedings of 1<sup>st</sup> International Workshop on Fluorosis Prevention and Defluoridation of Water*. Ngurdoto, Tanzania. New Zealand: The International Society for Fluoride Research; 1995. p. 115-7.
51. Krishnamachari KA. Skeletal fluorosis in humans: A review of recent progress in the understanding of the disease. *Prog Food Nutr Sci* 1986;10:279-314.